

Journal of Educational Research & Social Science Review (JERSSR)

English Textbooks and Presentation of Colonial Legacy: A Content Analysis of Punjab Government's English Textbooks for Secondary Schools 1957-1962

1. **Dr. Sumaira Noreen** Head (Incharge), History Department & Collaborative Faculty, Faculty of Education, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore
Email: summoreen2@yahoo.com
 2. **Aqsa Tahir** History Department, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore, Pakistan
-

Abstract

Textbooks are often identified as great objects in promoting and fostering the sense of identity among students. In the postcolonial context, textbooks have also been analysed as an instrument of colonial legacy. This research presents a comparative analysis of prescribed English textbook for schools in use just before the declaration of the first military rule by Ayub Khan in Pakistan and those that were being implemented during early years of Ayub Khan Rule. The strategy of content analysis of sample textbooks is adopted for the study. The sample English textbooks include Parkinson's Selection of English Verses and English textbooks of Short Poem Collection as well as Secondary Stage English that were published by Punjab University Board in 1957 and in 1961-62 respectively. While portrayal of colonial legacy is adopted as main focal theme of research, it is further analysed into binaries and operationalised into three categories including British glorious history, British culture and Oriental imagining of British culture. Actual texts from textbooks are presented as evidence to support the argument and to ensure validity of the study. Based on the content analysis of textbooks, the data findings reveal that the notion of colonial legacy in pre and early Ayub Khan Era varies from each other. In comparative terms, the data findings reveal a depiction of the glorious history of British and of West as a model for developed nations in the textbook of pre-Ayub Khan Era, and not as much on aspect of colonial rule in the history of Pakistan in the textbooks of early years of Ayub Khan Rule in Pakistan.

Keywords: English textbooks, content analysis, colonial legacy, secondary curriculum, Punjab Textbook Board

Introduction

Colonialism was a global phenomenon that dominated the period between early sixteenth century to twentieth century (Muller, 2018). And no less significant was the emergence of postcolonial states since the mid twentieth century onwards; when the socio-cultural, economic, and political colonial legacies were put into question. In this reference, the continuing English language education in the post-colonial states could be explained as one of the powerful manifestations of the continuing colonial legacies. Phillipson highlights the significance of English language as not only a lingua franca but also a 'lingua economica', 'lingua emotiva', 'lingua cultura', 'lingua bellica', 'lingua academica', 'lingua divina', 'lingua diabolica', and 'lingua tyrannosaura' (2009, 10-11). When taken in the post-colonial context, the formal English language education is often discussed with reference to global imperialism, and hegemony (Hsu, 2017), and/or power and elitism (Phillipson, 1992), an international language which 'celebrates globalisation yet limits integration' by constructing an 'inferior Other' (Ha, 2005), etc. Taking on from Acar (2006, 175), the dissemination of English language at global level has led into variants of English when introduced into changed socio-cultural milieus. Hence, the case of institutionalized non-native colonial English can be analysed as something being 'transplanted' into the new socio-lingual and cultural contexts of states like India, Nigeria, Singapore, etc.; asking for 'a pluralistic perspective' while analysing these (Acar, 2006, 175-182). Such pluralism refers not only to the academic use of language and teaching styles as well as the use of English for the sake of cross-cultural communication, but also to the socio-cultural political learning outcomes which can be traced within the curriculum policies and texts.

Curriculum texts are used as the key sites where the state engages not only in identity construction (Tormey, 2006), it also controls the access of individuals to different discourses (Ball, 1990). Therefore, curriculum is often seen as something contentious involving struggles that extend beyond simple debates of what we want to impart to our young ones. Such curriculum debate also lends itself to answering the complex questions of “who we are”, leading on to the definition or re-definition of identity (Pinar, 1993; Apple, 2004). When presented in the textbooks, the curriculum text serves as a major tool in promoting one or more than one particular identities. In other words, textbook contents are the constructs that promote the given state identity (Hau, 2009); serving as crucial structures in the process of constructing legitimate ideology and beliefs reflecting history, knowledge and values of the powerful in society (Crawford, 2003). No denying the fact that textbooks are ‘published within political and economic constraints of markets, resources and power’ (Apple, 1993, 46), the textbooks’ content represent broader cultural ‘messages’ that are in to line with government policies (Crawford, 2003, 6). ‘School textbooks are purposeful,’ because these are ‘developed with political aims’ (Banejeer & Stober, 2016, 143). Taken in the colonial context, these are also considered as a ‘vibrant tool of colonial power, prestige and privilege’; which present the past in ways that justify the implementation and continuity of ‘a capitalist settler society as a natural, evitable and commonsensical’ (Muller, 2018). Therefore, for the sake of analysis, the relevance of finding out aspects of colonial education in the postcolonial context become even more essential.

When discussed in the broader context, it is believed that the legacy should be analysed in terms of the underlying philosophy of British empire which was guided by commerce, the spread of Christianity, and western civilization among the colonized (Nkomazana, 1998; Etherington, 2005). In this context, it is being highlighted that initially missionaries had played significant role in promoting Christianity as the religion of civilization and development in colonies (Okon, 2014). And the supremacy of Western civilization over indigenous cultures in the Indian subcontinent was maintained through an institutionalized education system (Farooq, 2014). To Alexander Duff who was considered as the founding father of missionary education:

‘the grand object of education, which all ought constantly to avow, is moral and intellectual regeneration of the universal mind – or in the speediest and most effective manner to reach and vitally impress the entire body of the people of Hindoostan’.

(cited in Farooq, 2014, 134).

Christian norms and practices were being introduced in the name of civilising societies, and in that way the Britain culture and institutions had provided the yardstick for such civilization agenda (Porter, 1985, 599). To Porter, the civilization mission in Indian subcontinent was bound with steady introduction of the western learning that brought western ways and culture together (1985, 602). Certainly, textbooks had an important role to play for implementation of such agenda.

In the post-colonial context, the idea of superiority of western culture has been taken up in the critical theory traditions of research. For instance, the Edward Saidian concepts like *Orientalism* are explained as post-colonial connotations challenging the continuity of colonial constructs in a post-colonial existence. Such conceptions explain a duality when refer to the West defining itself as a superior civilized nation, and imagining East as an exotic but inferior nation (Smith, 2016, 68). In other words, encountering East has been significant for the self-image of West producing identities ranging from decadent European modernity to concepts of cultural, racial and moral superiority (Clarke, 1997, 3-4). In writings following Edward Said’s tradition, it is highlighted that because the ‘colonial project’ had demanded not only providing the ruler a ‘patriotic sense of the possession of a great literature of his own’, the project was also implanted with intent to ‘impressing the native with the cultural superiority of the ruler’ (Rajan, 1986, 28). Similarly, others following Frantz Fanon (1963) would say, ‘history originates from the point of view of the colonizer or the settler’ and that ‘change can come about only from the point in time that the native decides that colonization must end’ (Burney, 2012, 30). The postcolonial contexts of many states depict such assertions and calls for change. But the question is to how much could such change be possible? This paper focusses on this question with particular reference to the presentation of aspects of colonial legacy in English textbooks being prescribed by the Punjab Secondary Education Board two decades after Pakistan’s independence from British rule in the Indian subcontinent.

Colonial Legacy and the post-Colonial Context

Pakistan's existence as a postcolonial reality has been explained with reference to the lingering shadows of colonial past which has constantly interfered with the socio-political cultural identity as well as with efforts for reforms in state education system. As a post-colonial state, its formation was an act of ideological imagination based on Two-Nation theory. Aside from religious homogeneity, Pakistan was an ethnically, culturally, linguistically diverse and unevenly developing state with a colonial past (Durrani & Dunne, 2016). Early independence period of Pakistan was a time of great challenge for educational administration which had its roots in colonial existence. The situation had turned further challenging in 1958 with the imposition of martial law in the country.

General Ayub Khan declared the military coup as a 'revolution' which was necessary for the sake of developing a 'sound, solid and strong nation' (Cohen, 2004, 64-65). Pakistan must be prepared 'to move forward and keep pace with the fast-moving world' of present and the future times to come, Ayub Khan had held with vigour (Saigol, 2003, 17). He adopted a different approach for the state's consolidation; to combine the state's ideology with the Western style economic development strategies (Haqqani, 2010; Rizvi, 2000, 79). 'We were fortunate to have a religion which could serve as a vehicle of progress', he had claimed with clarity (Ansari, 2011, 49). And for him, so was significant to setting modernization as the foremost aim for development (Saigol, 2003, 17). To Saigol, his persistent passion for Pakistan becoming a modern nation, in terms of a progressively industrialised and economically developed country which was armed with scientific knowledge and technical know-how, could be seen visible in his policies (2003, 15).

Being a 'pro-West leader' (Naghman, 2012, 51), his reason for consolidating relations with Western world was deemed necessary 'for attaining a reasonable posture of advancement' (Haqqani, 2010, 39). For him, Pakistan was way behind in the race of modernization versus other countries (Saigol, 2003, 17). In the pursuit of progress at national level, Ayub Khan aimed to develop those diverse skills in the indigenous people of Pakistan which 'transformed Western civilizations' through the use of education (Saigol, 2003, 23). He also asserted that it was essential for Muslims to acquire knowledge of modern science and technology (Kanwar, 1971, 264); because, 'as a subject country.....we became a stagnant society' as Ayub Khan had exclaimed once (Saigol, 2003, 19). He also believed that prior to his military takeover, the education system of Pakistan had failed to do away with the continuing colonial 'slavish mentality' of the people (Noreen, 2014, 187). Hence the time for removing the unwanted British colonial legacies from the education system but without disregarding the developmental aspects of modern knowledge that did not interfere with Muslim's religious ideology and nationhood.

That began with his ambition to transform Pakistani nation into intellectually coherent and administratively effective nation that could serve as a role model for other nations. In his self-declared revolution, Ayub Khan introduced several reforms especially in education sector as he believed that education could serve as an effective tool towards modernisation of society and state consolidation (Haqqani, 2010). He declared that the existing system of education in Pakistan was 'legacy of the past' (Noreen, 2014, 187). And in order to suggest educational reforms, he established Education Commission, also called Sharif Commission which presented a comprehensive report, being described as the 'Magna Carta of educational reforms in Pakistan' (Saigol, 2003, 1). Based on the recommendations of Sharif Commission report, textbooks were designed reflecting the government policies (Lall, 2010). While adopting of liberal view of a state's ideology, Ayub Khan also paid attention to existing educational ideologies of developed world striving to achieve standard of comprehensive curricula since World War II (Noreen, 2014, 191-192). It is believed that Ayub Khan's rule had patronised education along the objectives of modernization of economy and society (Saigol, 2003, 2). This article analyses the English textbooks of 1957 and 1961-62 for exploring the aspects of colonial legacy as were represented in Punjab secondary curriculum English textbooks during pre and early rule of Ayub Khan.

Research Question

What are the manifestations of colonial legacy representation in the English textbooks of Punjab secondary curriculum before and during early rule of Ayub Khan?

Methodology

Based mainly on qualitative design, this research conducts content analysis of sample English textbooks with a deductive strategy. Covering the years 1957-1962, the research data is based on the

displayed the greatness of their nation. Highlighting the trait of English nation with a heroic tale, poem started with the funeral of their hero, Sir John Moore. He was buried by his fellow soldiers on the very land where he fought for his country. Everyone was silent, swallowed their grief over losing him. This silent funeral was unlike what he deserved especially a great man like him. Without a coffin, he was covered on his military cloak which he wore when he was fighting with valor. Now, he was laying there like a warrior and a hero. The second aspect which the poem highlighted was the attitude of the fellow soldiers in the amidst of the war. Those soldiers suffered from a great loss. Though, they were busy in burying their hero. But they didn't forget the scenario around them, not let the death scared them. They were not afraid on meeting the same end like their hero. Death was a common scenario in the war, and they knew it very well. Upon hearing the enemy's voices, getting their artillery ready for the fight again. They got ready for their duty as protectors of their homeland, leaving their sorrows behind. At the end, it was clear that hero's grave was lost. But he found never-ending fame in the history great men of their nation, (Ch5, The Burial of Sir John Moore by Sir Charles Wolfe, 15-16).

Twelveth poem also set the scenario of war, an English war against Russian and Cossacks. This poem, like the previous one, highlighted the trait of English nation as a great one. This poem highlighted the notion of patriotism. It was illustrated with act of obedience towards the orders, loyalty towards the duty and love for one's own homeland. Through the patriotism, the valor of those six hundred British soldiers who marched into the valley of death fighting for their country, and later on known for their obedience and bravery was exhibited. The idea of obedience as portrayed by those soldiers displayed their loyalties as well as devotion towards their nation. Them, fighting with valor and losing their lives made them honored ones. Though they didn't return, but they would always be remembered for their obedience, loyalty and devotion. They showed no fear of death and revealed no anxious thoughts on the mistaken order. Their names were engraved in the history of their nation. It was their passion for victory, a way of expressing love for their country by marching into a bloody battle know that they would be died for sure, (Ch12, The Charge of Light Bridge, 51-53).

Table 2

Delineation of Colonial Legacy in English Textbooks of 1961-1962.

Sub-theme	Textbook Evidence	Codes	Collective Depiction
British Culture	The way of Praying as poet says 'Said on her knees her favorite Prayer,' (PCh1, 8). A Christian tradition and compare with the whiteness Cherry Blossom as poet say 'Wearing white for Eastertide.' (PCh3, 12).	Praying Style Christian Festival	Notions of Christianity
	'Father in Thy Heaven' in children's song, (Ch7, 24).	Principal Idea	
Oriental imagining of British culture	Mr. Jamil's praise for the policeman for his politeness, (PCh2, 10-11).	Admiration for London Police	British Supremacy
	Discipline of people at rush hours, (Ch2, 11).	Attributes of London people	
	Surprised by underground railway, electric trains, automatic doors, moving stairs, (Ch2, 11).	Astonished by technology	
	Liverpool as a port and Industrial town, (Ch7, 59).	Progressive	
	American books, movies, (Ch16 162). Eager to see New York, (Ch16, 163-165).	Fascination for America	
	Technology of USA buildings. Eating at the Drugstore, famous Streets of New York, (Ch17, 173-175).	Overall Admiration	

Sources: This table is developed by researchers based on two English textbooks, Short Poem Collection (1961) and Secondary Stage English (1962).

British Culture

From the content list of 15 poems of 1961 textbook, first poem was about a simple village girl named Lucy whose job was sewing. She worked from the early morning till the night. When the night approached, now she couldn't continue his work. So, she said goodnight to her work. Given the village scenario, she saw birds flying back to their home. Domestic animals such as horses and sheep said good night to the girl in their own languages. Everyone was excited for night. The girl just didn't say good night to sun. There are different time zones in the world and there is not any time in the world where the sun is not present and fulfilling its job. Before going to the bed, Lucy prayed. The method of praying given was that she prayed on her knees. It gave an image of Christianity and its praying style. Then, she went to sleep, and after spending the night sleeping peacefully, next day she woke up and start her work again, (Ch1, Good Night and Good Morning by Lord Houghton, 8).

The third poem depicted and appreciated the beauty of nature. The breath-taking sight of cherry blossom was standing out among others. For the poet, he had only fifty years from his threescore years to enjoy such beautiful natural beauty. Threescore years is actually seventy years which is considered average age of a man according to the Bible. The whiteness of cherry blossom was compared with the Christian festival of Eastertide where wearing white is a custom. These two ideas highlighted the notion of Christianity. In the end, for the poet, life was so short to appreciate beauty of cherry blossom, (Ch3, Loveliest of Tree by A. E. Housman, 12).

The seventh poem promoted the love for the homeland and pray of children to God to make them ideal citizens of a society. Children called help from Father in Heaven; it gave an image of Christianity. For a better society, they were responsible for their actions like their ancestor, protect their homeland and not let the daunted sacrifice to the waste, (Ch7, The Children's Song by Rudyard Kipling, 24).

Oriental imagining of British culture

From the content list of 20 chapters of 1962 textbook, second chapter highlighted different aspects related to western world which were admired by indigenous people of Pakistan society. Mr. Jamil, a middle-class man who visited London for the first time in his life asked directions from the London policeman. The attitude and behavior of the policeman was admired by him to the point where rather than asking any stranger, he would always look for the policeman. Second aspect admired by him was the display of discipline and rational behavior during the rush hours from the people of London. Mr. Jamil also admired their technological progression which he observed during underground railway journey, (Ch2, Mr. Jamil in London, 10-11). In the seventh chapter, the importance of Liverpool, a city of United Kingdom was highlighted, port-wise as well as industrial-wise, (Ch7, John Brown's House, 59). In sixteen chapter, Mr. Aftab and his family who already lived in London had an opportunity to visit a great country like America. Filled with excitement, they started their journey from the Queen Elizabeth, biggest passenger lines in the world. In America, they saw tall large buildings and admired the heating and cooling system in those buildings, (Ch16, A Visit to New York, 162-165). In seventeen chapter, some prominent places of New York were discussed which Pakistani family considered brightest such as 42nd Streets, Time Square and Rockefeller Centre. Second, eating at the drugstore was a splendid idea for the children. In the end, whole family had a delightful view of New York from standing at the 87th floor of any tall building of USA, (Ch17, A Visit to New York, 171-174).

Comparative Analysis of pre- & early rule of Ayub Khan rule textbooks

Table 1 gives the existence of colonial legacy in sample textbook of pre-Ayub Khan era. The representation of colonial legacy is highlighted through the 'British glorious history'. The aspect deals with the notion as showing some of the characteristics of English nation such as describing them a proud nation who is obsessed with victory and praising their leaders who lead them towards it. Second trait is showing them a courageous nation who does not think twice for sacrificing their lives for the country and accept to be buried in nameless grave on the battlefield. Third trait highlights them as a nation who is filled with obedience and loyalty and does not flinch even before death if it is to fulfil the duty. In the English textbook of 1957, the colonial legacy highlights the notion in which English are characterized with their history.

Table 2 highlights the two different aspect of colonial legacy. In the early Ayub rule textbooks, colonial legacy is portrayed in a new way which is a different approach than the per Ayub era textbook. In those sample textbooks, the idea of colonial legacy is presented with the religious aspect

of British culture such as depiction of different notions of Christianity. Second aspect is portrayed as an inspiration which highlights the English supremacy over indigenous people. This aspect is analysed in the context of Oriental imagining of British culture. It highlights the notion of creating West a model for indigenous people to take inspiration from and follow them to enter into the comity of developed nations.

Discussion

The textbooks' analysis is done into binaries in this article. In the textbooks of pre- Ayub Khan rule, the case of colonial legacy with reference to the British glorious history had highlighted their characteristics as a great nation. Whereas the idea of colonial legacy was approached differently in the English textbooks of early Ayub Khan's rule. It revealed different aspects of colonial legacy. The result indicated that two notions of colonial legacy such as British culture and British supremacy were promoted in the sample textbooks. That highlighted West as a developed and well-behaved nation and portrayed as a model for indigenous people to take inspiration from. As told above, Ayub Khan's reign was a break from instability in Pakistan. His era is significant in promoting national consciousness which was to reconstruct along modernity, and development through education (Saigol, 2003, 2). The first notion of colonial legacy portrayed western nation as religiously earnest, the second notion represented the idea of West superiority in the English textbooks of early Ayub Khan rule. It was highlighted in terms of *Orientalism* which is defined as process of West defining itself as a superior, civilized nation, and imagining East as an exotic but inferior nation (Smith, 2016, 68). In the era of Ayub Khan, the idea of modernization was emphasized, 'the idea of being modern was to become like the other -the previously colonial master' (Saigol, 2003, 17). In the sample textbooks, such aspect of English supremacy over indigenous people was not lacking. For instance, an expressed fascination of natives for western territories like London, Liverpool and America, inspiration sought from the London Police's politeness and the discipline of English people during rush hours, and an overall admiration of them, etc. are but a few to mention here. In those textbooks, a model was created for indigenous society to seek inspiration from. West was portrayed as a great nation in various aspects of morality, disciplined behavior, and modernisation. The data findings portraying the supremacy of West in modernization and development may also side with Saigol's account that 'we must learn from other countries especially modern and developed one' so as to put an end to the 'backwardness' of natives (Saigol, 2003, 17-19). Hence, as revealed in the data findings, the notion of doing away with colonial legacy during Ayub Khan era was promoted with a different approach than was depicted in previous textbooks of pre-Ayub Khan era. Instead of highlighting the great history of English people as a nation with great history, their cultural representation as being a devout nation was first presented along the religious aspect. Second, within the context of *Oriental* imagining of British culture, it mostly highlighted the aspect of modernization. The data findings portrayed West, especially London, and New York, as being modern and progressive places with morally well-behaved people who should be looked at as a model by the Pakistani nation. It shall not be wrong to conclude here that aspects of colonial legacy had prevailed in the textbooks of Ayub Khan era but with a focus on seeking inspiration for development and modernity.

References

- Acar, A. (2006). Models, Norms and Goals for English as an International Language: Pedagogy and Task Based Language Teaching and Learning. *Asian EFL Journal Quarterly: Special Conference Proceedings Volume: Task-based Learning in the Asian Context*, 8(3), 174-191.
- Ansari, S. H. (2011). Forced Modernization and Public Policy: A Case Study of Ayub Khan Era (1958-69). *Journal of Political Studies*, 18(1), 45-60.
- Apple, M. (2004). Culture Politics and The Text. (Eds), In Ball, S. J. *The Routledge Reader in Sociology of Education*. London: Routledge.
- Apple, M. (1993). *Official Knowledge: Democratic Education in Conservative Age*. London: Routledge.
- Arndt, J. C., Galgano, M. J. & Hyser, R. M. (2012). *Doing History: Research and Writing in Digital Age*. US: Cengage Learning.
- Ball, S. J. (1990). *Foucault and Education: Discipline and Knowledge*. London: Routledge.
- Banerjee, B. K. & Stober, G. (2016). The Portrayal of the Other in Pakistani and Indian School Textbooks. (Eds), In William, J. H. & Bokhorst-Heng, W. D. (Re)Constructing the Memory Textbooks, Identity, Nation and State. Netherland: Sense Publishers.
- Burney, S. 'Orientalism: The Making of the Other', in *Counterpoints, Pedagogy of the Other: Edward Said, Postcolonial Theory, and Strategies for Critique* (Peter Lang, 2012).

- Cohen, S. P. (2004). *The Idea of Pakistan*. Washington: Brooking Institution Press.
- Cole, F. L. (1988). Content Analysis: Process and Application. *Clinical Nurse Specialist*, 2(1), 53-57.
- Crawford, K. (2003). The Role and Purpose of Textbooks. *History Education Research Journal*, 3, 5-10.
- Clarke, J. J. (1997). *Oriental Enlightenment: The Encounter Between Asia and Western Thoughts*. London: Psychology Press.
- Durrani, N. & Dunne, M. (2016). Curriculum and National Identity: Exploring the Links between Religion and Nation in Pakistan. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 42(2), 215-240.
- Etherington, N. (2005). *Missions and Empire: Oxford History of British Empire Companion Series*. Oxford: OUP Oxford.
- Farooq, M. (2014). The Aims and Objectives of Missionary Education in the Colonial Era in India. *Pakistan Vision*, 15(1), 118-142.
- Haqqani, H. (2010). *Pakistan: Between Mosque and Military*. Washington: Brooking Institution Press.
- Ha, P. L. (2005). Toward a Critical Notion of Appropriation of English as an International Language, *Asian EFL*, 7.
- Hau, M. (2009). Unpacking the School Textbooks, Teachers and Construction of Nationhood in Mexico, Argentina and Peru. *Latin American Review*, 44, 127-154.
- Hickey, G. & Kipping, C. (1996). Issues in research; A multi-stage approach to the coding of data from open-end questions. *Nurse Research*, 4(1), 81-91.
- Hsu, F. (2017). Resisting the Coloniality of English: A Research Review of Strategies. *The CATESOL Journal*, 29, 1.
- Kanwar, M. A. (1971). Traditional and Modern Trends in Pakistan: A Muslim Society in Transitions. *Social Compass*, 18(2), 263-277.
- Lall, M. (2010). Education Dilemmas in Pakistan. (Eds), In Lall, M. & Vicker, E. *Education as Political tool in Asia*. England: Taylor & Francis.
- Levine-Donnerstein, D. & Potter, W. J. (1999). Rethinking the Validity and Reliability in Content Analysis. *Journal of Applied Communication Research*, 27, 258-284.
- Muller, L. (2018). Colonialism. (Eds), In Fuch, E. & Bock, A. *The Palgrave Handbook of Textbooks Studies*. US: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Naghman, C. (2012). *Pakistan's First Military Coup: Why did the First Pakistani Coup Occur and Why does it matter*. Master Thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, United States.
- Nkomazana, F. (1998). Livingston's idea of Christianity, Commerce and Civilization. *Bostwana Journal of South Africa*, 12, 44-57.
- Noreen, S. (2014). *Dynamics of Secondary Curriculum Organization in Pakistan: An Historical Perspective from 1947-1974*. Ph.D. Thesis, Royal Holloway College, University of London.
- Okon, E.E. (2014). Christian Missions and Colonial Rule in Africa: Objective and Contemporary Analysis. *European Scientific Journal*, ESJ, 10(17).
- Phillipson, R. (2009). Disciplines of English and disciplining by English. *Asian EFL Journal*, 11(4), 8-30.
- Phillipson, R. (1992). *Linguistic imperialism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Pinar, W. (1993). Notes on Understanding Curriculum as a Racial Text. (Eds), In McCarthy, C. & Crichlow, W. *Race, Identity, Representation in Education*. New York: Routledge.
- Porter, A. (1985). 'Commerce and Christianity' The Rise and Fall of a Nineteenth Century Missionary Slogan. *The Historical Journal*. 28(3), 597-621.
- Rajan, R. S. (1986). After 'Orientalism': Colonialism and English Literary Studies in India, *Social Scientist*, 14 (7), 23-35.
- Rizvi, H. A. (2000). *Military, state and society in Pakistan*. UK: Palgrave Macmillan
- Saigol, R. (2003). *Becoming a Modern Nation: Educational Discourse in Early years of Ayub Khan (1958-1964)*. Islamabad: COSS.
- Smith, A. (2016). Heteropatriarchy and Three Pillars of White Supremacy, Rethinking the Women of Color Organizing. (Eds), In *Color of Violence: The Incite! Anthology*. US: Duke University Press.
- Tormey, R. (2006). The Construction of National Identity through Primary School History: The Irish Case. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 27(3), 311-324.